arXiv:1404.6261v1 [math.CO] 24 Apr 2014

On sets of integers with restrictions on their products

Michael Tait*, Jacques Verstraëte**

Department of Mathematics
University of California at San Diego
9500 Gilman Drive, La Jolla, California 92093-0112, USA

Abstract

A *product-injective labeling* of a graph G is an injection $\chi : V(G) \to \mathbb{Z}$ such that $\chi(u)\chi(v) \neq \chi(x)\chi(y)$ for any distinct edges $uv, xy \in E(G)$. Let $P(G)$ be the smallest $N \geq 1$ such that there exists a product-injective labeling $\chi : V(G) \to [N]$. Let $P(n,d)$ be the maximum possible value of $P(G)$ over n-vertex graphs G of maximum degree at most d. In this paper, we determine the asymptotic value of $P(n,d)$ for all but a small range of values of d relative to n. Specifically, we show that there exist constants $a, b > 0$ such that $P(n,d) \sim n$ if $d \leq \sqrt{n}(\log n)^{-a}$ and $P(n,d) \sim n \log n$ if $d \geq \sqrt{n}(\log n)^{b}$.

1. Introduction

Let G be a graph. A *product-injective labeling* of G is an injection $\chi : V(G) \to \mathbb{Z}$ such that $\chi(u) \cdot \chi(v) \neq \chi(x) \cdot \chi(y)$ for distinct edges $uv, xy \in E(G)$. Let $P(G)$ denote the smallest positive integer N such that there is a product-injective labeling $\chi : V(G) \to [N]$. In this paper, our main results give asymptotically tight bounds on $P(G)$ relative to the maximum degree d and number of vertices of the graph G, for all but a small range of values of $d \leq n-1$. Let $P(n,d)$ be the maximum possible value of $P(G)$ over n-vertex graphs G of maximum degree at most d. Specifically, we prove the following theorem:

Theorem 1. *There exist constants $a, b > 0$ such that* (i) *$P(n,d) \sim n$ if $d \leq \sqrt{n}(\log n)^{-a}$ and* (ii) *$P(n,d) \sim n \log n$ if $d \geq \sqrt{n}(\log n)^{b}$.*

An old result of Erdős [4] implies $P(K_n) \sim n \log n$, whereas Theorem 1 shows that $P(G) \sim n \log n$ for graphs which are much sparser than K_n. The labeling of the vertices of any n-vertex graph G with the first n prime numbers is always a product-injective labeling from $[N]$ where $N \sim n \log n$, via the Prime Number Theorem. An analogous result to Theorem 1 for labelings of graphs where differences or sums are required to be distinct for distinct edges was obtained by Bollobás and Pikhurko [3], where a change in behavior was also observed around $d = \sqrt{n}$.

*Corresponding author
**Research supported by NSF Grant DMS-1101489.
Email addresses: mtait@math.ucsd.edu (Michael Tait), jverstra@math.ucsd.edu (Jacques Verstraëte)

Theorem 1 will be proved with $a > \log 2$ and $b > 4.5$; while our method allows these values to be slightly improved, new ideas would be needed to determine $P(n,d)$ for all the intermediate values of d. In fact, the proof of Theorem 1(ii) establishes the much stronger result that if G is the random graph on n vertices with edge-probability d/n and $d \geq \sqrt{n}(\log n)^b$, then $P(G) \sim n \log n$ almost surely as $n \to \infty$. We also remark that Theorem 1 determines the maximum value of $P(G)$ over n-vertex graphs with m edges for almost all possible values of m.

Notation and Organization. The paper is organized as follows. The proof of Theorem 1 uses the modified local lemma, which we state in Section 2, together with some facts on the distribution of the number of divisors function τ. The proof of Theorem 1(i) is given in Section 3, and Theorem 1(ii) is proved in Section 4.

For real numbers $y \geq x \geq 1$, we use the notation $[x] = \{1, 2, \ldots, \lfloor x \rfloor\}$ and $[x, y] = [y] \backslash [x]$. Let the Erdős-Rényi random graph, $G_{n,p}$, be a graph chosen from the probability space $\mathcal{G}_{n,p}$ where edges of K_n are present in $G_{n,p}$ independently with probability p. For background on random graphs, see Bollobás [2]. All logarithms will be in the natural base, and all graphs will be simple and finite. If $(A_n)_{n \in \mathbb{N}}$ is a sequence of events in a probability space, then we say A_n occurs almost surely as $n \to \infty$ if $\lim_{n \to \infty} P(A_n) = 1$. We write $f(n) \sim g(n)$ for functions $f, g : \mathbb{Z}^+ \to \mathbb{R}$ if $f(n)/g(n) \to 1$ as $n \to \infty$ and $f(n) \ll g(n)$ if $f(n)/g(n) \to 0$ as $n \to \infty$.

2. Preliminaries

To prove Theorem 1, we make use of a probabilistic result known as the modified local lemma, together with some well-known facts from analytic number theory regarding the number of divisors of positive integers.

Modified local lemma. The modified local lemma, which is a version of the Lovász Local Lemma (see Alon and Spencer [1], page 65), is used in the following form:

Proposition 1. *Let $A_1, ..., A_n$ be events in a probability space and for each $i \in [n]$, let (J_i, K_i) be a partition of $[n] \backslash \{i\}$. If there exists $\gamma \in [0, 1)$ such that*

$$\mathbb{P}\left(A_i \mid \bigcap_{k \in K} \overline{A}_k\right) \leq \gamma(1 - \max|J_i|\gamma)$$

then

$$\mathbb{P}\left(\bigcap_{i=1}^{n} \overline{A}_i\right) > 0.$$

Distribution of the number of divisors. For a natural number k, let $\tau(k)$ be the number of divisors of k, and let $\Omega(k)$ be the number of prime power divisors of k. The Hardy-Ramanujan Theorem [5] gives $|\{x \leq N : |\Omega(x) - \log\log N| \gg \sqrt{\log\log N}\}| \ll N$ as $N \to \infty$. Since $\tau(n) \leq 2^{\Omega(n)}$, one has the following result:

Proposition 2. *Let $\omega(N) \to \infty$ as $N \to \infty$. Then*

$$|\{n \le N : \tau(n) \ge (\log N)^{\log 2} 2^{\omega(N)\sqrt{\log\log N}}\}| \ll N.$$

In fact it turns out that Ω and $\log \tau$ have normal orders – for more on normal orders see Tenenbaum [7].

3. Proof of Theorem 1(i)

We show that $P(G) \sim n$ for any graph G with $V(G) = [n]$ and maximum degree

$$d \le \sqrt{n}(\log n)^{-\log 2} 2^{-\omega(n)\sqrt{\log\log n}},$$

where $\omega(n) \to \infty$ and $\omega(n) \le \sqrt{\log\log n}$. This in turn shows that Theorem 1(i) holds for any $a > \log 2$. Let $m = \lceil 4n/\omega(n) \rceil$, and let L be the set of the first $n + m$ natural numbers with at most

$$t = \omega(n)^{-1}(\log n)^{\log 2} 2^{\omega(n)\sqrt{\log\log n}}$$

divisors. Since $\omega(n) \le \sqrt{\log\log n}$ and $m \ll n$, Proposition 2 shows that

$$\max L \sim n + m \sim n.$$

Now uniformly and randomly select an n-element subset $\{\ell_1, \ell_2, \dots, \ell_n\}$ of L and define the injective labeling $\chi(i) = \ell_i$. For an unordered pair $\{xy, uv\} \in \binom{E(G)}{2}$ of distinct edges of G, let $A_{xy,uv}$ be the event $\chi(x)\chi(y) = \chi(u)\chi(v)$ and define

$$J_{xy,uv} = \{A_{jk,rs} : \{j,k,r,s\} \cap \{x,y,u,v\} \ne \emptyset\} \quad \text{and} \quad K_{xy,uv} = \binom{E(G)}{2} \setminus J_{xy,uv} \cup \{A_{xy,uv}\}.$$

We apply the modified local lemma, Proposition 1, to the events $A_{xy,uv}$. Fixing any set $K \subset K_{xy,uv}$, the set

$$M := L \setminus \{\chi(z) : z \in V(G) \setminus \{u,v,x,y\}\}$$

has size at least $m + 4$. For any labels $\chi(u), \chi(v) \in M$, the number of ways of choosing $\chi(x), \chi(y) \in M$ such that $\chi(x)\chi(y) = \chi(u)\chi(v)$ is at most

$$\tau(\chi(u)\chi(v)) \le \tau(\chi(u))\tau(\chi(v)) \le t^2.$$

Therefore

$$\mathbb{P}(A_{xy,uv} \mid \bigcap_{\{jk,rs\} \in K} \overline{A}_{jk,rs}) \le \frac{t^2}{\binom{|M|}{2}} < \frac{2t^2}{m^2}.$$

Note that regardless of the labeling of u, v, x and y, none of the events $A_{jk,rs} : \{jk, rs\} \in K$ occur, since only edges which contain at least one of u, v, x and y are affected by the labeling of u, v, x and y. For any $\{xy, uv\} \in \binom{E(G)}{2}$,

$$|J_{xy,uv}| \le 4d|E(G)| \le 2d^2 n.$$

Taking $\gamma = 1/(4d^2 n)$, and using $m^2 \ge 16 d^2 t^2 n$, we find

$$\gamma(1 - \gamma \max |J_{xy,uv}|) \ge \frac{1}{8d^2 n} \ge \frac{2t^2}{m^2}.$$

By the modified local lemma, the probability that none of the events $A_{xy,uv}$ occur is positive. In other words, there exists a product-injective labeling $\chi : V(G) \to [N]$ where $N = \max L \sim n$. $\square$

4. Proof of Theorem 1(ii)

In this section, we prove that labeling with primes is asymptotically optimal for graphs that are much less dense than K_n, namely for the random graph $G_{n,d/n}$ with $d \geq \sqrt{n}(\log n)^b$ and $b > 4.5$. Since $G_{n,d/n}$ for $d \geq \sqrt{n}(\log n)^b$ has maximum degree asymptotic to d, this is enough for Theorem 1(ii). Throughout this section, if H is a graph then $C_4(H)$ is the number of 4-cycles in H.

4.1. Counting 4-cycles

Lemma 1. *Let $B = B(U, V)$ be a bipartite graph with $|U| = m$ and $|V| = n$, and let d be the average degree of the vertices in V. If $nd^2 \geq 4m^2$ and $d \geq 2$, then*

$$C_4(B) \geq \frac{n^2 d^4}{64m^2}.$$

Proof. This is a standard exercise in applying Jensen's Inequality, but we include the proof for completeness. Let $M = \binom{m}{2}$ and let $d(u, v)$ be the codegree of u and v, that is, the number of vertices of B adjacent to both u and v. Then the number $C_4(B)$ of 4-cycles in B is precisely

$$C_4(B) = \sum_{\{u,v\} \subset U} \binom{d(u,v)}{2}.$$

Let $M = \binom{m}{2}$. By Jensen's Inequality, and since

$$\sum_{\{u,v\} \subset U} d(u,v) = \sum_{w \in V} \binom{d(w)}{2},$$

we have

$$C_4(B) \geq M \binom{\frac{1}{M} \sum_{w \in V} \binom{d(w)}{2}}{2}.$$

By Jensen's Inequality again,

$$\sum_{w \in V} \binom{d(w)}{2} \geq n \binom{d}{2}.$$

Therefore

$$C_4(B) \geq M \binom{\frac{n}{M} \binom{d}{2}}{2}.$$

Since $nd^2 \geq 4m^2$, and $\binom{x}{2} \geq \frac{1}{4}x^2$ for $x \geq 2$,

$$\frac{n}{M} \binom{d}{2} \geq \frac{nd^4}{2m^2} \geq 2.$$

Using $\binom{x}{2} \geq \frac{1}{4}x^2$ again for $x \geq 2$,

$$C_4(B) \geq \frac{n^2 d^4}{64M} \geq \frac{n^2 d^4}{64m^2}.$$

This proves the lemma. □

4.2. Counting solutions to $uv = xy$

A solution to $uv = xy$ is non-trivial if $\{u, v\} \neq \{x, y\}$.

Lemma 2. *For all $\varepsilon > 0$, there exist $\delta > 0$ and $n_0(\varepsilon)$ such that for $n \geq n_0(\varepsilon)$, if $A \subset [n]$ and $|A| \geq (1+\varepsilon)n/\log n$, then the number of non-trivial quadruples $\{a, b, c, d\} \in \binom{A}{4}$ satisfying $ab = cd$ is at least $\delta n^2 (\log n)^{-8}$.*

Proof. Let $n_0(\varepsilon)$ be the smallest positive integer such that for $n \geq n_0(\varepsilon)$,

$$\frac{\varepsilon\sqrt{n}}{(2\log n)^2} \geq 2. \tag{1}$$

$$\frac{\varepsilon^2 n^2}{(2\log n)^4} \geq \frac{n^2}{(\log n)^6}. \tag{2}$$

$$(1 + \tfrac{1}{2}\varepsilon)\frac{n}{\log n} \geq \pi(n). \tag{3}$$

$$\pi(n) - \pi\Big(\frac{n}{2(\log n)^3}\Big) - \pi(n^{2/3}) \geq 4(\log n)^6. \tag{4}$$

Note that the last pair of inequalities is possible since $\pi(n) \sim n/\log n$ by the Prime Number Theorem. We shall prove the lemma with $\delta = 2^{-14}\varepsilon^4$ and $n \geq n_0(\varepsilon)$.

Consider the bipartite graph $H = H(U, V)$ with parts $U = [n^{2/3}] \cup P$ and $V = [\sqrt{n}]$, where P comprises the primes in the interval $[n^{2/3}, n]$, and where $uv \in E(H)$ if there exists $a \in A$ such that $a = uv$ with $u \geq v$. Erdős [4] made the following observation:

for any $a \in [n]$, there exist $u \in U$ and $v \in V$ such that $a = uv$ and $u \geq v$.

Consequently, $|E(H)| = |A|$. If $\{uv, vw, wx, xu\}$ is a 4-cycle in H, then $uv, wx \in A$ and $vw, xu \in A$ and $(uv)(wx) = (vw)(ux)$. Therefore $C_4(H)$ is the number of non-trivial solutions to $ab = cd$ with $a, b, c, d \in A$. For the remainder of the proof, we show $C_4(H) \geq \delta n^2 (\log n)^{-8}$.

Let k_0 be the largest integer k such that $2^{k+1} < \sqrt{n}/(\log n)^3$. For $1 \leq k \leq k_0$, let

$$U_k := \{u \in U : 2^{k-1}\sqrt{n} \leq u < 2^k\sqrt{n}\} \quad \text{and} \quad V_k := \{v \in V : v \leq 2^{1-k}\sqrt{n}\}.$$

Denote by H_k the subgraph of H induced by U_k and V_k. Also, let H_0 be the subgraph of H induced by U_0 and V_0, where

$$U_0 = \{u \in U : u > n/2(\log n)^3\} \quad \text{and} \quad V_0 = \{v \in V : v \leq 2(\log n)^3\}.$$

Then $H = \bigcup_{k=0}^{k_0} H_k$. We consider the subgraphs $H_k : k \geq 1$ separately from H_0.

Claim 1. *If for some $k \in [k_0]$, $|E(H_k)| \geq \varepsilon n/(2\log n)^2$, then $C_4(H_k) \geq \delta n^2 (\log n)^{-8}$.*
Proof. The average degree in H_k of vertices in V_k is

$$d = \frac{|E(H_k)|}{|V_k|} \geq \frac{\varepsilon 2^k \sqrt{n}}{(2\log n)^2}.$$

Since $n \geq n_0(\varepsilon)$, (1) gives $d \geq 2$ and (2) gives $|V_k|d^2 = |E(H_k)|^2 \geq 4|U_k|^2$. By Lemma 1 with $m = |U_k|$,

$$C_4(H_k) \geq \frac{\varepsilon^4 n^2}{2^{14}(\log n)^8} = \delta n^2 (\log n)^{-8}.$$

This proves the claim. □

Since $C_4(H) \geq C_4(H_k)$, we are done if $|E(H_k)| \geq \varepsilon n/(2\log n)^2$ for some $k \in [k_0]$, so we assume this is not the case for any $k \in [k_0]$. Then

$$\sum_{k=1}^{k_0} |E(H_k)| \leq \frac{\varepsilon k_0 n}{(2\log n)^2} < \frac{\varepsilon n}{4\log n}. \tag{5}$$

Next we consider H_0.

Claim 2. *If $C_4(H) < \delta n^2(\log n)^{-8}$, then*

$$|H_0| < \pi(n) + \frac{16\delta^{1/2} n}{\log n}. \tag{6}$$

Proof. Let $\tilde{U}_0$ comprise all vertices of U_0 of degree at least two in H_0 and let $\tilde{H}_0$ be the subgraph of H_0 induced by $\tilde{U}_0 \cup V_0$. Then

$$|E(H_0 \backslash \tilde{H}_0)| \leq |U_0| \leq \pi(n) \tag{7}$$

Let d be the average degree in $\tilde{H}_0$ of the vertices in $\tilde{U}_0$. Then $d \geq 2$ and by (4), $|\tilde{U}_0|d^2 \geq 4|\tilde{U}_0| \geq 4|V_0|^2$. By Lemma 1 with $m = |V_0|$,

$$C_4(\tilde{H}_0) \geq \frac{|\tilde{U}_0|^2 d^4}{64m^2} \geq \frac{|E(\tilde{H}_0)|^2}{64m^2}. \tag{8}$$

Since $C_4(H_0) < \delta n^2(\log n)^{-8}$ and $m \leq 2(\log n)^3$, (8) gives

$$|E(\tilde{H}_0)| < 8\delta^{1/2}(\log n)^{-4} mn < \frac{16\delta^{1/2} n}{\log n}.$$

Together with (7), this completes the proof of Claim 2. □

We now complete the proof of the lemma. By (5) and (6),

$$|E(H)| \leq \sum_{k=0}^{k_0} |E(H_k)| < \pi(n) + \frac{16\delta^{1/2} n}{\log n} + \frac{\varepsilon n}{4\log n}.$$

Since $\delta = 2^{-14}\varepsilon^4$, the last two terms above are at most $\varepsilon n/2\log n$. By (3), $\pi(n) \leq (1 + \varepsilon/2)n/\log n$, so we conclude $|E(H)| < (1+\varepsilon)n/\log n$. Since $|A| = |E(H)|$ and $|A| \geq (1+\varepsilon)n/\log n$, this contradiction completes the proof. □

4.3. Proof of Theorem 1(ii)

Let $\varepsilon > 0$, and let δ be given by Lemma 2. Let $p = 2(\log n)^{4.5}/(\delta\sqrt{n})$. For a fixed labeling $\chi : V(G_{n,p}) \to \mathbb{Z}$, let $\mathbb{P}(\chi)$ denote the probability that χ is a product-injective labeling of $G = G_{n,p}$. To prove Theorem 1(ii), we show that if $n \geq (1+\varepsilon)N/\log N$, then the expected number E of product-injective labelings $\chi : V(G) \to [N]$ satisfies

$$E = \sum_{\chi : V(G) \to [N]} \mathbb{P}(\chi) \leq \binom{N}{n} \max_{\chi} \mathbb{P}(\chi) \ll 1. \tag{9}$$

To prove this, we show $\mathbb{P}(\chi) \ll N^{-n}$ for every fixed labeling $\chi : V(G) \to [N]$. Let $k \in [N^2]$, and let g_k be the number of representations (for the given function χ) of the form $k = \chi(i)\chi(j)$. Then for χ to be product-injective, for each k, at most one of the g_k possible edges $\{i, j\}$ with $k = \chi(i)\chi(j)$ may be selected to be in the random graph G. Therefore,

$$\mathbb{P}(\chi) = \prod_{k=1}^{N^2} (1-p)^{g_k} + g_k p(1-p)^{g_k - 1}. \tag{10}$$

For a real-valued function f, let $f_+ = \max\{f, 0\}$. Then by Lemma 2, if $n \geq n_0(\varepsilon)$, then

$$\sum_{k=1}^{N^2} (g_k - 1)_+ \geq \frac{\delta n^2}{(\log n)^8}. \tag{11}$$

If $g_i \geq g_j + 2$, then (10) increases by replacing g_i with $g_i - 1$ and g_j with $g_j + 1$. So by (11)

$$\mathbb{P}(\chi) \leq \big((1-p)^2 + 2p(1-p)\big)^g = (1-p^2)^{g/2} \leq e^{-p^2 g/2},$$

where $g = \delta n^2 (\log n)^{-8}$. Since $p^2 g \geq 4n \log n$, $\mathbb{P}(\chi) \leq n^{-2n} \ll N^{-n}$. This proves (9), and completes the proof of Theorem 1(ii). □

References

[1] N. Alon, J. Spencer. The Probabilistic Method, Wiley, New York (2000).

[2] B. Bollobás. Random Graphs, Cambridge university press, 2001.

[3] B. Bollobás and O. Pikhurko. Integer sets with prescribed pairwise differences being distinct. *European J. Combin.* 26 (2005), no. 5, 607 – 616.

[4] P. Erdős, On sequences of integers no one of which divides the product of two others and on some related problems. *Tomsk. Gos. Univ. Ucen. Zap.* **2** (1938), 74-82.

[5] G. Hardy and S. Ramanujan. The normal number of prime factors of a number n. *Quarterly Journal of Mathematics* 48 (1917), 76–92.

[6] M. Tait, J. Verstraëte. Sum-injective labellings of graphs. Preprint (2014).

[7] G. Tenenbaum. Introduction to analytic and probabilistic number theory, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1995, Cambridge studies in advanced mathematics, No. 46.